



Question and Answers with Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee

Translated by Abu Iyaad Amjad Rafiq

This is a question and answer session that took place with Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee al-Madkhalee during Ramadan 1424H concerning the affairs of tabdee`, jarh, hajr and related affairs. It was posted on AnaSalafi.Net today or maybe yesterday (transcribed by Abu Hamaam Naasir al-Qat`anee). Inshaa'Allaah it will be serialised in this thread.

QUESTION 1: ON COMPANIONSHIP AND GIVING ADVICE	2
QUESTIONS 2-4: ON BOYCOTTING, TYPES OF OPPOSITION, AND DISTINGUISHING BETWEEN THE INNOVATOR AND HIS FOLLOWERS	2
QUESTIONS 5-7: WARNING AGAINST DISPARAGED PEOPLE OUTSIDE OF THEIR OWN CITIES, OBLIGATION OF ADVICE WHEN IT IS REQUIRED TO BE GIVEN, AND LISTENING TO THE RECITATIONS OF THE INNOVATORS	3
QUESTIONS 8-10: HOW TO RECTIFY THE CONFUSED AND DECEIVED YOUTH, REGARDING THOSE WHOM THE SCHOLARS HAVE DIFFERED OVER, AND HOW TO DEAL WITH THE INNOVATORS WHEN THEY HAVE STRENGTH AND THE UPPER HAND	5
QUESTIONS 11-12: WHEN TO START TAKING CLEAR POSITIONS AGAINST THOSE WHO FALL INTO DEVIATION FROM THE SALAFEES, AND REGARDING ASSOCIATION WITH THE PEOPLE OF INNOVATION.....	7
QUESTIONS 13-15: ILLUSTRATIVE EXAMPLE OF WHAT AND WHAT IS NOT A HARM OR BENEFIT IN BOYCOTTING, AND EXAMINING THOSE WHO CLAIM REPENTANCE FROM HIZBIYYAH BY MONITORING THEIR CONDUCT	8

Question 1: On Companionship and Giving Advice

Question: Shaykh, a person mixes with the opposers, is he to be aligned with them?!

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: Yes, he is to be aligned them.

Question: Does [giving] advice consume a long time?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: No, it does not consume [lots of] time, it is in accordance with what a person sees, sometimes it can be in a [single] sitting, sometimes it could be in two sittings, sometimes it could be in three when that person has a shubhah (doubt, misconception), and sometimes it could be with [just] a word. This is in accordance with the situation of the one being advised, and the [nature] of the issue in which the one being advised is in.

Question: This aligning (ilhaaq), O Shaykh, the one who is put alongside with the person that is an innovator, is he to be boycotted [as well]?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: How can we not boycott him, put him alongside him, meaning, boycott him!

Question: There is a Salafee person who mixes with an Ikhwaanee, does he take the same ruling?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: Yes, put him alongside him.

Question: Whilst looking at the benefits (masaalih) and harms (mafaasid) O Shaykh?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: The benefits that they speak of, and keep revolving around, then the harms that result in the likes of these situations are greater than them (the benefits). For the harm of the likes of this one (i.e. a Salafee who mixes with a Hizbee) is greater upon Ahl us-Sunnah, more severe than the harm of the Hizbiyyeen upon them. Because caution can be taken against a clear Hizbee, as for this one who is between (this) and between (that), he comes to those (the Hizbees) and he comes to those (the Salafees), he is corrupted by them (the Hizbees), and he is not rectified by them (the Salafees), therefore the caution from him, it is obligatory that it be greater.

Questions 2-4: On Boycotting, Types of Opposition, and Distinguishing Between the Innovator and His Followers

Question 2: Some people in this time hold the absence of hajr (boycotting) in this time and that [the need for] hajr is not found, using the fataawaa of Shaykh Naasir al-Abaanee, so how do we refute them?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: This is not correct... this speech, it is not correct, Shaykh al-Albaanee (rahmatulLaah `alayhi) is speaking about what he knows, and then boycotting brings benefit by some people (when it is done by them), so negating this Sunnah is not correct, completely, it is not correct!

Question 3: Is every opposer (mukhaalif) an Innovator, O Shaykh?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: No...No... there is permissible differing (khilaaf saa`igh) in which differing is permitted, meaning an issue when it is an issue of a fiqh judgement, so this (person) takes a view and considers that his evidences are stronger, so this is not to be considered ibtidaa` (innovating). As for the opposition that is intended by the one who desires this question, then what is intended by it is speech concerning the `usool (foundations) of the religion. Yes, concerning the beliefs of the Muslims, then not everyone who opposes this is an Innovator, because an ignorant person may oppose, he does not know, he does not know whether this is opposition, he believes it is the truth. So what is obligatory is to explain to him, and when he persists after that, he is an Innovator due to his opposition, it is necessary to explain, clarify (bayaan).

Question 4: Is there a difference between a leader (ra's) and a follower (taabi`)?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: [Yes] No doubt... that there is a difference between an Innovator being a head of innovation, or a caller to innovation, or a founder (originator) of innovation, and between his followers, because his followers vary, since amongst them is one who knows and one who does not know.

Questions 5-7: Warning against disparaged people outside of their own cities, obligation of advice when it is required to be given, and listening to the recitations of the Innovators

Question 5: A person is disparaged in a particular city, and he is not known in another city... is it permissible to warn against this person?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: If he is not known, so long as he is not a caller, then it is sufficient that his ruling remain amongst the people of his city. However, when he (the one disparaged) comes across people of another city, then the basis, support (of warning against him) in this matter [returns back] to the one whose speech is given consideration and who is depended upon from the people of his (the disparaged person's) city, from those who have spoken about him. This is because the townspeople of that man are more knowledgeable of him, and [this is] with the condition that his speech about him is upon truth and justice.

Question 6: There is for example, one to whom you say, "Advise your brother", he says to you, "It is not obligatory upon me to advise, if you wish, you advise, I will advise", is this correct? Meaning, it is not obligatory upon specific individuals?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: The Prophet (sallAllaahu `alayhi wasallam) says, "Whoever amongst you sees an evil, then let him change it with his hand, and if he is not able, then with his tongue, and if he is not able, then with his heart, and that is the weakest of faith". So when you see someone who has an obligatory right of naseehah from you, then it is obligatory upon you [to give it to him] before him (the other person), unless you have an overwhelming belief that he will not accept it from you, and perhaps he may accept it from him (the other person) due to his nearness to him, or because he is affable (i.e. close, friendly) with him. So then, the giving of naseehah, goes on to him, and it is removed from you, and this is a correct and considered viewpoint.

Question: So the giving of advice is not removed (from that person) in totality?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: No, it is not removed from him in totality.

Question: Some youth in Libya heard some speech of Shaykh Rabe` that it is not obligatory to give naseehah...(words not understood)

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: What does he...?

Question: Warn from him without naseehah!

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: No, clarification (al-bayaan), clarification [is given] to him, advice for his own benefit. There is no binding link between warning and between inviting him (to what is correct), namely, that calling him to the truth is one topic, and warning from him is a separate topic.

Question: So they warn from him without naseehah O Shaykh?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: The one whose innovation becomes known, and clarification (to him) and giving of advice to him is established, then it is not obligatory upon the people to advise him, it is obligatory upon them to follow their scholars regarding him, yes.

Question 7: Is it permissible to listen to the recitation cassettes of the people of innovation?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: By Allaah, it is more befitting that that is not done, because sometimes his heart may become attached to him, and it was said to Ibn Seereen, "Can I recite an aayah to you?", and he said, "No, not even half an aayah". Why? Because something of amazement with him might fall into his heart, and love of his recitation, and so he loves him from this angle, and thus he becomes a lover of the people of desires and innovations.

Questions 8-10: How to Rectify the Confused and Deceived Youth, Regarding Those Whom the Scholars have Differed Over, and How To Deal with the Innovators When They Have Strength and the Upper Hand¹

Question 8: What is the most exemplified way in dealing with the youth who have been confused, deceived by the people of innovation, and in directing them to the safe path?

¹ Posted In Reply On Salafitalk.net by ‘Abdul-Ilah

We asked this question last year after the Manhaj al Anbiyaa class.

Question to Sheikh Rabee’ ibn Haadi al Madkhalee on refuting the Partisan groups, dated 26/4/03 – 24 Safar 1424

Questioner: Some people say to us that we are weak and we are not able to refute the partisan groups and due to this they say we should not refute the partisan groups, so what is your advice O Sheikh?

Answer: Anyway, Salafiyyah has not reached this level of weakness and loss and to Allaah belongs all praise. In every time the Salafiyyoon enjoy the good and forbid the evil. And they warn against the innovators and the people of fitn. Anyway, if this companion of innovation is quiet then leave him to die with his innovation and do not mention him. However, if he was active in spreading his innovation and misguidance and his fitn then it is not allowed to be quiet upon this evil. And a Muslim now in any country is able, whether salafi or otherwise, is able to say a word of truth but with wisdom, proof and evidence.

If this innovation was being spread and it overwhelms the youth then you say we are weak but the situation is not like that. For by Allaah, they are not able to imprison you nor are they able to kill you. They are not able to do this in any country (amongst the countries of the world) and to Allaah belongs all praise. This is a blessing. “There will not cease to be a group clearly upholding the truth” They are clear, their statements are clear, their proofs are clear, and their actions also, all praise belongs to Allaah. They will not be harmed by those who oppose them nor by those who differ with them until the promise of Allaah comes. What is important is that the method must be honourable and there is wisdom along with proof. Barakallaahu feekum. If the situation is like that then whether the partisan groups like it or not and they will not be pleased in any day.

Also, if they are encouraged to promote their falsehood and they fill the world with it using their different methods, then if you are quiet and I am quiet then when will the people know the truth as Imam Ahmed rahimahullaah said. So refuting is an obligation upon them barakallaahu feekum.

Questioner: Is this to be always referred to the people of knowledge since some say you should not refute yourself for you live in the West but you must return to the people of knowledge and say what they have to say?

Answer: If it is possible to return to the people of knowledge then that is ok and mention their statements and if it is not possible and the innovation is clear and the misguidance is clear and you are able to clarify even if you are a student of knowledge then clarify it. If you are not able then it is not allowed for you to speak about the religion of Allaah, absolutely not, don’t speak except with knowledge “and do not speak without knowledge indeed the hearing, seeing, and heart all of them he will be responsible for.” Even the scholar, it is not allowed for him to speak except with knowledge, proof and evidence. This is speech regarding Allaah religion - Barakallaahu feek.

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: The most exemplified way is that they are referred to the people of knowledge regarding everyone about whom they have become confused, deceived, [to those people] amongst the people of knowledge who have spoken regarding him (i.e. from the people of innovation). How?!! For example, when so and so scholar speaks about any Zayd from amongst the people, and then they are confused, deceived regarding him (i.e. regarding that person who has already been spoken against), then it is said, "Ask so and so, because he has already spoken about him, and he is amongst the most knowledgeable people about him", so he they refer him back to him (that scholar). For by the likes of such a one, Allaah, by His bounty and mercy, raises the talbees (deception) made upon the people.

Question 9: Callers about whom the Scholars have differed over as regards their tawtheeq and tajreeh, or ta`deel and tajreeh, what is obligatory upon the general people amongst the Salafiyyeen regarding them (i.e. those differed over)?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: It is obligatory upon the general people amongst the Salafiyyeen to look at the saying of the one with the proof and evidence, regarding the one about whom the Scholars have differed over, in both jarh and ta`deel, as is the situation regarding those whom the Scholars differed over in either jarh or ta`deel during the era of narration (of ahaadeeth). For we find that Abu Haatim, Ahmad, al-Bukhaaree, Abu Daawood, an-Nasaa'ee and their likes, may Allaah have mercy upon them, differed over a narrator, and then others oppose them. So one comes and he commends one of them, and another comes and disparages. So Ahmad, Abu Haatim, and al-Bukhaaree commend, and Abu Daawood disparages, and an-Nasaa'ee disparages, and Abu Zur`ah disparages, and like this... So then we look at their statements and we depend upon the proof, so whoever brought the proof, then he is given precedence. When the person making the disparagement brings his jarh, then overwhelmingly, it is the case that the disparagement is given precedence, because the one disparaging has additional knowledge with him, and then his saying is depended upon. And ta`deel in the presence of the jarh mufassar is not accepted, even if it was from a great (person). This is what is obligatory, it is obligatory that he look at the proof of each faction, and whoever brought the proof, then he has tread the path (to the goal), and it is obligatory to make ittibaa` of him.

Question: But Shaykh, the general person does not know the proof (hujjah)!!!

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: The speech regarding the person (being spoken of) is for the one who has ability! As for the general people who do not have any knowledge, then there is nothing for them but taqleed of the Scholars, and making ittibaa` of the scholars regarding this.

Question: The scholars can sometimes differ in at-ta`deel and at-tajreeh...

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: [interjecting]... the general people make ittibaa` of them, they follow the Scholars.

Question: The Scholars differ regarding ta`deed of a person, and tajreeh of him!

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: Who will direct the general people? It is you, the students of knowledge, you look at who is the person with the proof, and then you direct the people, you say "the correct, true saying is the saying of so and so, the evidences are with him", yes, the general people are not left to be wasted!

Question 10: When the people of innovation have strength in the land, and they have the power, ability to fight against the da`wah, are they to be boycotted?!?!

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: No... No... caution, vigilance is taken against them, yes, caution is taken against the people of desires and innovations when Ahl us-Sunnah are weak. For it is obligatory upon Ahl us-Sunnah to be cautious, vigilant about the people of innovation and that they are witful regarding them. Because in taking this way (of boycotting) there is an eradication of the lineage (i.e. continuance) of Ahl us-Sunnah, so it is not permissible for them to take this (way). It is obligatory upon them to be witful, vigilant regarding them, and that they hold out, that they hold out, as much as they are able, that they are witful, vigilant, and that they hold out as much as they are able, because they are weak.

Questions 11-12: When to Start Taking Clear Positions Against Those Who Fall Into Deviation From The Salafees, And Regarding Association with the People of Innovation

Question 11: When a person falls into deviations (inhiraafaat), and does not return (from them), some of the youth say that he is Salafee and that he has errors. So is this saying [...unclear]... about those individuals?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: Deviations (inhiraafaat) are of types (aqsaam) and levels (maraatib), so either the deviations will be towards innovations, or they will be less than that, meaning towards fisq (sin), so when they (the deviations) are towards innovations, then all of the speech regarding this is what has already preceded (in the preceding answers).

Question 12: When a youth warns from an individual with a corrupt manhaj, then (certain) individuals rush to us, saying, "he is Salafee, his `usool are Salafiyyah, and we shall have patience upon him just like Shaykh Rabee` had patience with al-Maghraawee and `Adnaan `Ar`oor, and just like Nuh had patience with his people"... so what is your saying?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: This is not correct, when the people (who had) patience (in relation to that person) have ended their (time) of patience, then what do you want?! It is obligatory upon us to follow them, when they (the people who showed patience over

him) have ended (their time of patience), then it has ended. As for when it has not, then the speech is not for us, it is for the people of knowledge regarding this matter, they are to be waited upon (i.e. wait for them), they are the ones who will issue (a position regarding this).

Question: Some of the Salafee youth gives salaams to the people of innovation and shakes hands with them, so when you explain (matters) to him and advise him he says (as an excuse) that there are worldly benefits (masaalih) between him and that person, so is this a (valid) excuse?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: When he has a ta'weel saa'igh (an interpretation in the matter which is permissible, acceptable), then there is no harm, as for when his ta'weel (interpretation of the matter) is not permissible, then no. The religion is given precedence over the benefits of the world. Yes.

Questions 13-15: Illustrative Example of What and What is not a Harm or Benefit in Boycotting, And Examining Those Who Claim Repentance from Hizbiyyah by Monitoring Their Conduct

Question 13: There is a man with us, Shaykh Rabe'e was asked about him a while ago Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: [interjecting]... where, in Libya?

Questioner: In Libya

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: Yes

Questioner: So he [the Shaykh] said that he is from Ahl ul-Bid'ah, and he is to be boycotted, and [that he is] a Hizbee. And acting upon this speech was concluded, and the youth took this fatwaa, and they boycotted this individual. However he has some strength in the land and he was able to remove some of the Salafi youth from the pulpits (of the mosques, i.e. have them suspended), and the youth do not cease to boycott him and call to boycotting him!!

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: When it does not affect Ahl us-Sunnah, and all praise is due to Allaah, and one or two (from amongst them) are suspended, then this is not [considered] an effect, this is not an effect, and the Sunnah remains, and is [still] apparent. As for when it is feared for Ahl us-Sunnah in general from the likes of this [such that] their lineage (i.e. continuity) will be cut off [and ended], then no! Shaykh Rabe'e does not speak with this, and we know him to be the greatest of the people in guarding over the benefits and harms.

Question 14: When we wish to warn from a person, they say that "he has Salafee usool", so who is the one to judge that he has Salafee usool?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: This is floating question... Salafee usool, where is he going?!?! The one whose usool are Salafee, he is a Salafee, and a Salafee is not warned against. Only a Khalafee is warned against, and therefore, there will not remain with him Salafee usool, or [word unclear] an asl from the usool of Salafiyyah with him, what will remain?!? Meaning the speech is not precise, explain to us with an example that explains it so that I can understand it!

Question 15: Is the report of the one who repents from Hizbiyyah accepted, and is the boycott removed from him immediately, or after a year as `Umar (radiyAllaahu `anhu) did with Subaygh bin `Asal?!?

Shaykh Muhammad bin Haadee: The one who repents from Hizbiyyah, we examine (monitor) him, we examine him! [We do] not, when he comes to us at length, leave him and for mere spite say "find fault with him"? No! We examine him. How do we examine him? By him living with us (i.e. mixing amongst us) . Yes, he opposed us, [then] when he says "I repent to Allaah"... then [we say] "Welcome", we only have the outward (manifestation) [to judge by], but this outward manifestation is made apparent by what? With interaction, mixing (with him), and if he was hiding something from us, then verily Allaah, the Sublime and Exalted will uncover it. And we say, "walk amongst the people", and we will see him, in his conduct, in his actions, and in his istiqamah upon the Salafee manhaj, and if we see him upon other than that, then his hidden (reality) will have become apparent, and we will have known him as a kadhhaab (liar). And alongside that we also guard against ourselves.